هل العدد الذي يقول لا عصا في المخطوطات مفرد أم جمع؟ لوقا 9: 3

Holy_bible_1

15\7\2018

السوال

في الرد شبهة

هل امر السيد المسيح بأخذ عصى للطريق ولا لآ؟

ذكرت ان لوقا 9: 3 ذكر الكلمة بالجمع. فهل هي بالمفرد ام بالجمع

الرد

في البداية لن اتطرق لموضوع شبهة امر المسيح بأخذ عصا او لا لأني بمعونة الرب ردت عليها في هذا الملف

هل امر السيد المسيح بأخذ عصى للطريق ولا لآ؟

لكن هنا أركز على العدد في انجيل لوقا الذي قال لا تأخذ أي أكثر من عصا ولكي أؤكد ان لفظ عصا بالجمع هو النص التقليدي الصحيح سأقدم التراجم المختلفة ثم المخطوطات

والتراجم العربي غير واضح اللفظ لتشابه المفرد مع الجمع فأقدم التراجم الإنجليزي التي كتبت النص التقليدي بالجمع

(SVD)وقال لهم: «لا تحملوا شيئا للطريق لا عصا ولا مزودا ولا خبزا ولا فضة ولا يكون للواحد ثوبان.

(ACV) And he said to them, Take nothing for the way, neither staffs, nor bag, nor bread, nor silver, nor have two coats each.

(AKJ) And he said to them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor money, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(VW) And He said to them, Take nothing for the journey, neither staffs nor bag nor bread nor money; and do not have two tunics apiece.

(Bishops) And he saide vnto the: Take nothing to your iourney, neither staues, nor scrippe, neither bread, neither money, neither haue two coates.

(Mace) and he said to them make no provision for your journey: take neither staff, nor sack, nor bread, nor money; and but one coat for each.

(DRP (Gospels)) and said to them: "Take nothing for the journey—neither staffs, nor knapsack, nor bread, nor silver, neither have two tunics each.

(EMTV) And He said to them, "Take nothing for the journey, neither staffs nor knapsack nor bread nor silver; and do not have two tunics apiece.

(EVID) And he said to them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(Geneva) And he sayd to them, Take nothing to your iourney, neither staues, nor scrip, neither bread, nor siluer, neither haue two coates apiece.

(HNV) He said to them, "Take nothing for your journey--neither staffs, nor wallet, nor bread, nor money; neither have two coats apiece.

(IAV NC) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(IAV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(ISRAV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(JST) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(JOSMTH) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJVCNT) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJCNT) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for *your* journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJV-Clar) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJV-1611) And he said vnto them, Take nothing for your iourney, neither staues, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money, neither haue two coates apeece.

(KJV21) And He said unto them, "Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor pack, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(KJVA) And he said unto them, Take nothing for *your* journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(Litnt) AND HE SAID TO THEM, NOTHING TAKE FOR THE WAY; NEITHER STAVES, NOR PROVISION BAG, NOR BREAD, NOR MONEY, NOR EACH TWO TUNICS TO HAVE.

(LITV) And He said to them, Take nothing for the way, neither staffs, nor moneybags, nor bread, nor silver, nor each to have two tunics.

(LONT) And he said to them, Provide nothing for your journey; nor staves, nor bag, nor bread, nor silver, nor two coats apiece;

(MKJV) And He said to them, Take nothing for *your* journey, neither staffs, nor a bag, nor bread, nor money, nor each to have two tunics.

(NKJV) And He said to them, "Take nothing for the journey, neither staffs nor bag nor bread nor money; and do not have two tunics apiece.

(RNKJV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor scrip, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(TMB) And He said unto them, "Take nothing for your journey, neither staves, nor pack, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(Tyndale) And he sayd to them: Take nothinge to sucker you by ye waye: nether staffe nor scripe nether breed nether money nether have twoo cootes.

(Webster) And he said to them, Take nothing for *your* journey, neither staffs, nor bag, neither bread, neither money; neither have two coats apiece.

(Wesley's) neither staves, nor scrip, nor bread, nor money: neither have two coats apiece.

(WESNT) neither staves, nor scrip, nor bread, nor money: neither have two coats apiece.

(WORNT) And He said unto them, Take nothing for *your* journey, neither staves, nor bag, nor bread, nor money; nor two coats a piece.

(ALT) And He said to them, "Be taking nothing for the journey, neither staff nor traveler's bag nor bread nor money; neither be having two coats apiece.

(AMP) And He said to them, Do not take anything for your journey--neither walking stick, nor [1] wallet [for a collection bag], nor food of any kind, nor money, and do not have two undergarments (tunics).

(ASV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staff, nor wallet, nor bread, nor money; neither have two coats.

(BBE) And he said to them, Take nothing for your journey, no stick or bag or bread or money, and do not take two coats.

(CEV) He told them, "Don't take anything with you! Don't take a walking stick or a traveling bag or food or money or even a change of clothes.

(Darby) And he said to them, Take nothing for the way, neither staff, nor scrip, nor bread, nor money; nor to have two body-coats apiece.

(DRB) And he said to them: Take nothing for your journey, neither staff, nor scrip, nor bread, nor money; neither have two coats.

(ESV) And he said to them, "Take nothing for your journey, no staff, nor bag, nor bread, nor money; and do not have two tunics.^[1]

- (ERV) He said to them, "When you travel, don't take a walking stick. Also, don't carry a bag, food, or money. Take for your trip only the clothes you are wearing.
- (GNB) after saying to them, "Take nothing with you for the trip: no walking stick, no beggar's bag, no food, no money, not even an extra shirt.
- (GW) He told them, "Don't take anything along on the trip. Don't take a walking stick, traveling bag, any food, money, or a change of clothes.
- (ISV) He told them, "Don't take anything along on the trip-no walking stick, traveling bag, bread, money, or even an extra shirt.
- (NIRV) He told them, "Don't take anything for the journey. Do not take a walking stick or a bag. Do not take any bread, money or extra clothes.
- (NIV) He told them: "Take nothing for the journey--no staff, no bag, no bread, no money, no extra tunic.
- (NRSV) He said to them, "Take nothing for your journey, no staff, nor bag, nor bread, nor money-- not even an extra tunic.
- (RV) And he said unto them, Take nothing for your journey, neither staff, nor wallet, nor bread, nor money; neither have two coats.
- (YLT) And he said unto them, `Take nothing for the way, neither staff, nor scrip, nor bread, nor money; neither have two coats each;

فكل الترجمات التي تمثل النص التقليدي والاغلبية كتبت عصي بالجمع اما التي تمثل النص النقدي كتبت مفرد

النصوص اليوناني

التي قالت عصي بالجمع (رابدووس)

RP Byzantine Majority Text 2005

Καὶ εἴπεν πρὸς αὐτούς, Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν· μήτε <mark>ῥάβδους</mark>, μήτε πήραν, μήτε ἄρτον, μήτε ἀργύριον, μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

Greek Orthodox Church 1904

καὶ εἶπε πρὸς αὐτούς· Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν, μήτε <mark>ῥάβδους</mark> μήτε πήραν μήτε ἄρτον μήτε ἀργύριον μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

Scrivener's Textus Receptus 1894

καὶ εἶπε πρὸς αὐτούς, Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν· μήτε <mark>ῥάβδους</mark>, μήτε πήραν, μήτε ἄρτον, μήτε ἀργύριον, μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

Stephanus Textus Receptus 1550

καὶ εἶπεν πρὸς αύτούς Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν μήτε <mark>ῥάβδους</mark>, μήτε πήραν μήτε ἄρτον μήτε ἀργύριον μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν

Stephanus Textus Receptus 1550

και ειπεν προς αυτους μηδεν αιρετε εις την οδον μητε <mark>ραβδους</mark> μητε πηραν μητε αρτον μητε αργυριον μητε ανα δυο χιτωνας εχειν

Scrivener's Textus Receptus 1894 w/o Diacritics

και ειπε προς αυτους, Μηδεν αιρετε εις την οδον· μητε <mark>ραβδους</mark>, μητε πηραν, μητε αρτον, μητε αργυριον, μητε ανα δυο χιτωνας εχειν.

Byzantine/Majority Text (2000) w/o Diacritics

και ειπεν προς αυτους μηδεν αιρετε εις την οδον μητε <mark>ραβδους</mark> μητε πηραν μητε αρτον μητε αργυριον μητε ανα δυο χιτωνας εχειν

(ABP-G+) και G2532 ειπε G2036 προς G4314 αυτους G1473 μηδεν G3367 αιρετε G142 εις G1519 την G3588 οδον G3598 μητε G3383 ραβδους G4464 μητε G3383 πηραν G4082 μητε G3383 αργυριον G694 μητε G3383 ανα G303 δυο G1417 χιτωνας G5509 εχειν G2192

(ABP+) And^{G2532} he said^{G2036} to^{G4314} them,^{G1473} [²nothing^{G3367} ¹Take]^{G142} for^{G1519} the^{G3588} way!^{G3598} neither^{G3383} rods,^{G4464} nor^{G3383} provision bag,^{G4082} nor^{G3383} bread,^{G740} nor^{G3383} money,^{G694} nor^{G3383} [²up to G303 ³two^{G1417} ⁴inner garments G5509 ¹to have].^{G2192}

(IGNT+) και G2532 and G2036 G2036 G5627 He said G2036 G4314 To G2532 and G2036 G2036 G3627 He said G2036 G4314 To G3588 The G2036 G846 Them, G3588 G3367 Nothing G4082 G2036 G3598 G4464 G4082 G4

(SNT) και ειπεν προς αυτους μηδεν αιρετε εις την οδον μητε ραβδους μητε πηραν μητε αρτον μητε αργυριον μητε ανα δυο χιτωνας εχειν

التي قالت عصا (رابدون)

Nestle Greek New Testament 1904

καὶ εἶπεν πρὸς αὐτούς Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν, μήτε ῥάβδον μήτε πήραν μήτε ἄρτον μήτε ἀργύριον μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

Westcott and Hort 1881

καὶ εἶπεν πρὸς αὐτούς Μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν, μήτε ῥάβδον μήτε πήραν μήτε ἄρτον μήτε ἀργύριον, μήτε δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

Tischendorf 8th Edition

καὶ εἶπεν πρὸς αὐτούς· μηδὲν αἴρετε είς τὴν ὁδόν, μήτε ῥάβδον μήτε πήραν μήτε ἄρτον μήτε ἀργύριον, μήτε ἀνὰ δύο χιτῶνας ἔχειν.

فالحقيقة اغلبية النصوص اليوناني تؤكد النص التقليدي

المخطوطات

باختصار شديد كل المخطوطات التي تمثل النص التقليدي كتبت عصى

على سبيل المثال

الإسكندرية من القرن الخامس

BACIACIANTOYOYKALIACOMISSO ACOCNEIC KAICITIENTIPOCKY TOYOMHACHAIPETECICTHN OAON MHTEPARAOYCMHTC THIPAN MHTEAPTONMHTC APTYLION MHTEANAAYOXIIW MACCKCIN KAICICH NANOIKIA

وتصحيح الافرايمية

وغيرها من مخطوطات الخط الكبير

 $E^2HKUV\Gamma\Delta\Theta\Lambda\Pi$

m-1141

ποιο ασθόμοιω τασ · liai do him aportici

αρτομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το αμαι

αρτομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το αμαι

αρτομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το αμαι

αρτομ. μι το αργιριομ. μι το α

ومجموعة المخطوطات البيزنطى التي بالمئات ومخطوطات القراءات الكنسية

والترجمات اللاتينية القديمة من منتصف القرن الثاني وترجمات سريانية والجوارجينية وغيرهم الكثير وكثير من اقوال الإباء مثل يوسابيوس وغيره

وكما احصى فون سودين

Aδ | 3 ραβδους (Mt 10_{10} K) K gg Mρ H^{exc} δ3c 76 sa I αδ5 η ι φ a c 1091 f τ 72 f o 129 f σ207 1132 r δ398 | 1246 370f 1354 1385 1416 pa A1 A3 Ki 55f lat sy Euσ (1438) | add μητε υποδη-

اما التي كتبت عصا بالمفرد هي مخطوطات النص الاسكندري مثل السينائية والفاتيكانية وبيزا وغيرهم

ولهذا بعض علماء النقد النصي سواء تقليديين مثل سودين وأيضا نقديين مثل ديفيد بالمر قالوا ان النص الصحيح هو قراءة عصي بالجمع وهو فقط خطأ من نساخ النص الاسكندري انهم جعلوها بالمفرد لتتماشى مع بقيم الأسماء الموجودة في العدد التي جاءت بالمفرد

وقال لهم: «لا تحملوا شيئا للطريق لا عصا ولا مزودا ولا خبزا ولا فضة ولا يكون للواحد ثوبان فلأسف نساخ الخط الاسكندري وفقوا بين المفرد في الثلاث كلمات التالية فجعلوا عصا بالمفرد وهذا تساؤل بالمر

Did an Alexandrian copyist accidentally change the number of this word to the singular in conformity with the surrounding subjects in the phrase?

The ancient Greek text, alternating verse by verse with A new translation from the Greek by David Robert Palmer P, 43.

وهذا ما يتماشى مع قواعد التحليل الداخلي

فوجود كلمة جمع وسط مفرد هذه قراءة حادة وحسب قاعدة

The hardest reading is best

القراءه الاصعب هي الافضل

Difficilior lectio potior or Proclivi scriptioni praestat ardua

ومن تكلم عليها هو بنجيل (وبالنسبه له هي كانت القاعده الاساسيه)

وأيضا قاعدة

The reading which could most easily have given rise to the other readings is best.

القراءه التي هي بوضوح السبب في بقية القراءات هي الافضل

وهذه القاعده هي من انتاج تشندورف وهي القراءه الافضل هي التي تفسر بقية القراءات

فكما قال بالمر محاولة النساخ تصحيح ما ظنوه خطأ وهو كلمة بالجمع وسط مفرد هو الذي يفسر سبب

وتشابهها قاعدة

If one reading appears to be an intentional correction, the reading which invited such a correction is best.

لو قراءه تبدو مصححه, تكون القراءه التي دعت الى ذلك التصحيح هي الافضل

ولها تسميه اخري

That reading which is most likely to have suffered change by copyists is best.

اي القراءه التي عانت من تصحيح النساخ هي الافضل (قبل التصحيح) وهي اقترحها تشندورف مثل تفضيله للقراءه الحاده. وهي تعني لو كان هناك قراءه تدعوا الي التصحيح بالطبع قد يندفع ناسخ ويصححها

وأيضا حسب قاعدة

The reading which best fits the context or the author's theology (and ideology) is best.

القراءة التي تناسب الفكر اللاهوتي للكاتب هي الافضل

وكما نرى ان لوقا بوضوح في نفس العدد يطلب عن عدم اخذي شيء ثاني احتياطي (ولا يكون للواحد ثوبان) فهذا يناسب فكر الكاتب لوقا البشير

فاعتقد بالتحليل الخارجي والداخلي تأكدنا من ان قراءة عصي بالجمع هي الصحيحة وبهذا نكون تأكدنا ان مرقس البشير

6: 8 واوصاهم ان لا يحملوا شيئا للطريق غير عصا فقط لا مزودا ولا خبزا ولا نحاسا في المنطقة يقصد يأخذوا عصا واحدة

ولوقا البشير

وقال لهم: «لا تحملوا شيئا للطريق لا عصي ولا مزودا ولا خبزا ولا فضة ولا يكون للواحد ثوبان أي لا يأخذوا عصى احتياطي للطريق

واكتفي بهذا القدر

